

SPICE YEAR 6 COMMITTEE 1 MEETING MINUTES MAY 30, 2024



Minutes written by: Quantis

Participants (online, unless stated):

- Albea, Gilles Swyngedauw
- Aptar, Benedicte Luisi (on site)
- Berry Global, Élodie Roger
- Chanel, Helene Villecroze
- Clarins, Marion Ardin
- Coty, Isabelle Meylan (on site)
- Estée Lauder, Michael Christel
- Estée Lauder, Ana Espinosa
- Estée Lauder, Robert DiPalma
- Hermes Parfums, David Petit (on site)
- JPMS, Sean Ansett
- L'Oréal, Philippe Bonningue
- L'Oréal, Philippe Thuvien
- LVMH, Régine Frétard (on site)
- LVMH, Elsée Ekambi Eyoum
- Mary Kay Corp, Kristin Dasaro
- Meiyume, Jan Porter
- Meiyume, Aurélie Balmes
- Natura & Co, Alexis Rivers
- Natura & Co, Joanne Thornton
- N°7 Beauty Company, Steve Owen
- PUIG, Joaquim Cons
- Shiseido, Yuria Miyabayashi
- Texen, Christophe Cardi
- Texen, Younes El Omari
- Toly, Olaf Kahra

- Toly, Cheryl Bezzina
- Unilever, Frédéric Dreux (on site)
- Canopy Planet, Cecile Charleston
- Canopy Planet, Andrea Inness
- CITEO, Aude Fronteau (on site)
- FEBEA, Elodie Fiscaro
- FEVE, Fabrice Rivet
- RecyClass, Augusto Bruno
- MWE, Caroline Noyrez (on site)
- Quantis, Elsa Saouabi (on site)
- Quantis, Gabrielle Perier (on site)
- Quantis, Jean-Marc Fontaine (on site)
- Quantis, Victor Frontère (on site)
- Quantis, Nassim Bamin
- Quantis, Pierre Collet
- Quantis, Tasnim Balgobin

Excused SPICE Members:

- Axilone
- Sisley
- Cosmetic Valley
- Detic
- Elipso
- PCPC

Description: The Members of the SPICE initiative - the Sustainable Packaging Initiative for CosmEtics - gather for the first committee of the sixth year of the initiative.

Opening of the meeting

Introduction

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) welcomes all participants to the first committee of SPICE Year 6, presents the meeting's rules to ensure efficient discussions, and calls each member by company and name.

Meeting agenda

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) presents the meeting's agenda:

- 0. Antitrust Statement**
- 1. Launching Year 6**
- 2. SPICE Year 6 new workstreams**
- 3. Review of Year 6 existing workstreams**
- 4. Timeline and next steps**

0. Antitrust statement

Caroline Noyrez (MWE) introduces the antitrust statement (antitrust and confidentiality undertakings) that was duly signed by all participants:

While some initiatives among companies may be both legal and beneficial to their industry, group initiatives between competitors are often suspected to be anticompetitive and therefore illegal by National Competition Authorities.

In this respect, being a member of such an initiative, as being part of any formal or informal meetings, where other competitors are present, may involve risks, especially regarding the type of information likely to be shared around the table.

As a general rule, participants shall not exchange any sensitive information in relation to their business or company nor reach any understanding, expressed or implied, with the object or effect of restricting competition. Participants may only discuss the issues at hand in the agenda of the meeting. Therefore, it is the responsibility of each participant to avoid raising improper topics for discussion.

Participants to the meeting must not discuss topics such as:

- Prices, including any subject relating to prices or its components such as discounts, rebates, surcharges, price changes, price differentiation, profit margins, price increases, credit, or any other sales condition;
- Costs, including any component relating to costs such as production or distribution expenses, formulas for cost accounting, methods for cost calculation;
- Information relating to sales and company's production, especially production volumes, sales profits, operating capabilities, level of stocks or supplies;
- On-going non-public litigations;
- Any of a company's upcoming and confidential projects, including those relating to sales and to marketing strategy, along with production and technology, wage policy, R&D programs;
- Information relating to the relationship with customers/suppliers (including terms and conditions).

This applies not only to discussions in formal meetings but also to informal discussions before, during and after meetings.

Participants shall observe the below procedure for each meeting:

- The agenda of the meeting, including the name and position of each participant, must be submitted to legal review prior to the meeting.
- The meeting shall be conducted on the basis of the agreed agenda only.
- The antitrust statement may be read by each participant at the beginning of each meeting.
- If the discussions turn to improper subjects during a meeting, the concerned participants will be required to put an end to the discussion and to leave the meeting immediately.

- A comprehensive summary of all meetings shall be taken and shall be submitted to legal review prior to circulation.
- The summary shall be circulated to all members as soon as possible after the meeting.
- Any comment or request for amendment shall be notified as soon as possible following receipt of the summary.

She specifies that his role is to ensure that participants will not exchange commercial sensitive information as regards competition rules and that SPICE is not used as a cover for an anticompetitive agreement. It is the responsibility of each participant to avoid raising any improper subjects during the meeting. She develops the list of topics that are considered commercially sensitive from a competition law perspective (prices, costs, customer, general strategy, etc.).

1. Launching Year 6

SPICE Year 5 satisfaction survey and statistics

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) introduces the key results of the end-of-Y5 survey about the initiative but also SPICE tool. Jean-Marc informs members that one of the focus this year will be the development of the SPICE Tool. He then reminds members of all publications and webinars that happened in Year 5.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) – In the SPICE Tool, it is understandable to have the dataset personalized, but we need to be careful with the developments. If SPICE communicate in the future about value, we need to have rules to have common dataset. The reason and the strength of dataset is the shared development. Because it is a collaborative development it is sometimes easier to collect data at supplier level.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - This functionality will be developed within the SPICE Tool and there will be rules set under the GHG workstream.

A. Victor Frontère (Quantis) - Companies want more customization when it comes to the tools they are using. So, there is a competition with SPICE Tool if we don't provide specific data / personalization.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

New Steering Committee composition

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) introduces new steering committee members: Albéa and Aptar representing the suppliers and Estée Lauder and Puig representing the brands.

No question or comment from SPICE members.

Corporate members and associated members

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) gives an update regarding members and licenses. He informed members that glass suppliers are no longer part of the SPICE initiative and will now be represented by the FEVE.

No question or comment from SPICE members.

Year 6 timeline and budget allocation

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) reminds the roadmap by workstream and present the budget allocation. He then introduces the new Quantis team members for this year, particularly for the new taskforce.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) – Based on last year discussion, I understand why the glass supplier are no longer part of the initiative. But the question is, is the actual glass dataset robust enough? Is it only gas furnace?

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - The dataset used is the one from the general glass industry, provided by the FEVE. It is an average of the glass beverage packaging industry with gas furnace.

Q. Frederic Dreux (Unilever) - There is a regular a blocking point to have data about glass dataset. Is there any plan to update the dataset at some point?

A. Fabrice Rivet (FEVE) - Even at FEVE level, we don't have average flaconnage dataset as flaconnage is not a homogeneous sector, with very few players producing different types of products with different technologies. Averaging would therefore not be representative of anything. We will continue to monitor the evolution (e.g. electrification) of the sector and decide what to do in case the existing FEVE dataset become highly unreliable for flaconnage.

Q. Frederic Dreux (Unilever) - At Unilever, we use glass from an electric furnace and would want to see 'benefit' in the SPICE tool and simulate with 'real' data. A dataset development would benefit the glass industry as it would show the benefit of their new solution.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - It is a common goal we have here in SPICE but the dataset development is on hold until data collection is possible at supplier level. We welcome members to recommend how to continue collecting glass packaging data to develop and improve glass dataset in SPICE tool.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

VOTE: DO YOU APPROVE THE BUDGET ALLOCATION?

Y/N

Company	Vote
Albea	Yes
Aptar	-
Axilone	-
Berry Global	Yes
Chanel	Yes
Clarins	Yes
Coty	Yes
Estee Lauder	Yes
Hermes Parfums	Yes
JPMS	Yes
L'Oréal	Yes
LVMH	Yes
Mary Kay	Yes
Meiyume	Yes
Natura & Co	Yes
N°7 Beauty Company	Yes
Puig	Yes
Shiseido	Yes

Sisley	-
Texen	Yes
Toly	Yes
Unilever Prestige	Yes

Voting result:

19 voting members

YES 100% - NO 0% of voting corporate members

The new structure of the SPICE steering committee has been approved.

2. Year 6 new workstreams

New plastic Chemical Recycling benefits allocation

Pierre Collet (Quantis) introduces the new taskforce and its 2 new workstreams and their timelines: benchmark and specifications. He mentions that the idea for the taskforce is to develop guidelines to account for benefits of plastic chemical recycling, first starting with a framework benchmark, then identify processes and apply methodologies to the identified chemical recycling processes. The two main methodologies that will be assessed are PEF (Product Environmental Footprint) and TfS (Together for Sustainability).

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) suggests having technical working sessions as soon as possible.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) - A remark, I am currently the chairman of the technical committee of the ISCC, for mass balance accounting. How will we collect the data for GHG emissions? We are a bit early, for the moment processes are at pre-pilot or pilot level, most of factories are planned to open starting 2026. If we base this study on pilot-scale data, it might not reflect the same results as plant-scale (costs, efficiency, optimization, etc.). Where do we expect to have this data, because suppliers that are working on developing these plants will not have these data full-scale.

A. Victor Frontère (Quantis) - The idea here is not to have a recommendation on which process is better than the other, it is about how to allocate benefits and how to harmonize the rules on methodologies because otherwise everybody does what they want.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - By allowing more plastics to be recycled. Chain of custody models topic. Some models are not all at scale, but we want to focus more on the types of technology and allocation rules. If later SPICE members want to explore deeper topic, we could continue later when it starts to scale up.

A. Philippe Bonningue (L'Oréal) - I am not clear on the purpose and the true deliverables of this taskforce. I am not sure if we will work on knowing which assumptions to be taken or excluded from a LCA (as we know assumptions are key within a LCA), or if it will be on the results of the LCA per process themselves; I don't see very well what the deliverable could be. Maybe we can work more, upfront, on what we want to deliver, and frame correctly what we expect from that during an intermediate meeting.

A. Pierre Collet (Quantis) – The main objective of the taskforce is to highlight what are the burdens and benefits of the process, and where is it allocated.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) - If you believe it is useful to review the framing of the taskforce, would it help if I help Pierre to connect with some key players for polyolefins and polymers recycling?

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) – That would be great, we could do it during the technical working sessions in July. We will invite SPICE members with knowledge and interest in this topic to participate to the working session.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

New product emission data exchange protocol

Pierre Collet (Quantis) introduces the data exchange protocol taskforce, which will be organized in 3 steps: framework benchmark (PACT, TFS), determining pack specificities to align on existing frameworks, developing general recommendations and afterwards building a comprehensive framework for specific datasets development in a harmonized way. The objective is to help SPICE to understand which methodologies are aligned or not with SPICE methodology and define SPICE recommendations for cosmetics packaging, with a focus on key materials: glass, aluminum and plastics. Pierre adds that the guidance framework will provide SPICE users information on which suppliers datasets can be used, will include disclaimers and highlight best-in-class practices for EF development. The aim is really to be iterative and validate together the methodology before any publication.

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) informs members that if there is a deeper interest on the topic, it will be next steps of the project. He also informs members that there will be a technical working session on this topic.

Q. Fabrice Rivet (FEVE) - I understand that you propose to analyze PACT and TfS, but there are a lot of frameworks, why do you restrict to these two, when more exist like CDP, GHG Protocol, etc.

A. Pierre Collet (Quantis) – Other frameworks will be assessed. With PACT and TfS we focus more on what these guidelines recommend on data exchange, with the point of view of which data is acceptable or not. We do know that, for instance GHG Protocol is really focused on physical traceability, it might change in the future. We will take it into consideration of the analysis of course.

Q. Fabrice Rivet (FEVE) - Please consider what already exists in the sector, as my members already use CDP.

A. Victor Frontère (Quantis) - We will definitely check with CDP, but to me it's more of a data exchange framework.

Q. Jan Porter (Meyiume) - Can we have some clarification on what the final deliverable will be? GHGP specific frameworks? Guidelines for SPICE helping translate these frameworks?

A. Pierre Collet (Quantis) – The final deliverable will be guidelines, including what are the grey zones and their potential evolutions.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - We are exploring this vast topic. The first deliverable will be internal, and if we want to publish the guidelines externally, it will require more in-depth work. We will invite SPICE members with knowledge and interest in this topic to participate to the working session.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

Regulatory watch

Victor Frontère (Quantis) introduces the regulatory hub, a platform where members can share information on key regulations that are 'popping up' and being reviewed and/or voted, that members have on their radars. Victor mentions that we asked all federations, members of the initiative to share inputs (PCPC, CITEO, etc.) so we can centralize the information. He reminds the aim of this project, which is to leverage already existing knowledge between members. Victor then reminds members that a first inventory has been shared with members via the pre-read, covering Europe, the US and Australia. He encourages members to continue sharing regulatory updates at region/local side that are recent or coming.

Q. Fabrice Rivet (FEVE) - One comment regarding ESPR, cosmetics has been quoted in the JRC report as priority sector.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - As Victor just mentioned, we are asking SPICE members to share their knowledge. If there is a specific new regulation that a member has knowledge

about, we encourage the member to share deep dive information and we can share a template for the member to complete the information.

Q. Sean Ansett (JPMS) - Great news, thank you for sharing this information. I was wondering if we could consider SPICE to give some sort of paid access to non-members to this information?

A. Victor Frontère (Quantis) - We do not want the regulations hub to become a main topic for the SPICE initiative as we are not really equipped to do so. We recommend keeping this high-level view based on public information.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - We will reach out to members between each committee, so you can share the information that you have. If one of you has some interest or feedback, we can do a focus and present in the next committee.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

SPICE Insights: Ecodesign & circularity

Victor Frontère (Quantis) introduces the ongoing process and the next steps. He mentions that we have worked with an external copywriter to draft the document that has been reviewed by the Steering Committee. He then reminds members that the document was shared with all members one week prior the committee with a deadline of three weeks for members to share their feedback. Depending on feedback received, Quantis will work with the copywriter to review the paper prior sending the final version to members. There are two options: (i) the paper could be proposed to be voted during the next committee, or (ii) if there are few comments only and the members feel comfortable with the revised version, SPICE can organize an ad hoc vote, online (as per standard voting rules), before the next committee in September. Victor also reminds that feedback is needed from all members for the first SPICE insights paper.

No question or comment from SPICE members.

BREAK (15 mins)

3. Review of Year 6 existing workstreams

SPICE Tool developments

Elsa Saouabi (Quantis) gives an overview of improvements and development priorities for SPICE Year 6, with an approach in two phases. Elsa introduces the first priority which is the SPICE tool integration to connect with companies' internal systems and the timeline integrating the phases and Ecoinvent update. The second priority will be to integrate reuse in the SPICE Tool. The approach is to first define the tools parameters, run the scenarios and then proceeds with IT developments. Another focus is made on recyclability, to add recyclability assessment module. The third priority will be to create printable results to be available in PDF format.

Gabrielle Perier (Quantis) then introduces the database update to EI 3.10 which will occur this year. An impact analysis will be connected and communicated to the members. This update with the impact analysis will be available by the end of September. Gabrielle explains the main changes made by Ecoinvent, which are fuels, chemicals (olefins, aromatics and derivatives from petroleum refinery) and other details. These changes lead to an increase on the impact of plastics. Gabrielle then reminds that other databases did not do the update yet, which explain different results in LCAs.

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) informs members that a deep dive is available as there were several questions on this topic in the prior committee.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) - It will be great to create a short appendix to explain the criteria: single score, methodology itself, introduction of SPICE, etc.

A. Elsa Saouabi (Quantis) - We can work on creating a short appendix with the objective to keep it simple.

Q. Benedicte Luisi (Aptar) – Gabi also updated its database, and the data update go in the same direction.

A. Gabrielle Perier (Quantis) – Thank you for sharing, Benedicte, we will look into it.

Q. Steve Owen (N°7 company) - Will the increased plastic scores mean PCR gives a better and reduced climate action score now?

A. Gabrielle Perier (Quantis): Yes.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

SPICE datasets developments

Gabrielle Perier (Quantis) gives an update, executive summary and status of the SPICE dataset developments: wet molding, zamak 3 and 5, finishing processes, etc. She mentions that few datasets are in the pipeline for approvals before integration and additional datasets are on hold as we are waiting to identify a supplier. For example, for TPE, glue or converting processes. Gabrielle asks members to share contacts if they know suppliers for those datasets.

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) reminds members that their help is key to be able to continue developing those datasets.

Gabrielle Perier (Quantis) introduces another topic which is refining specific materials electricity mix. She shares which members that it is possible to reduce the environmental impact by improving the process itself, the energy sourcing or optimize the energy consumption. The objective is to show the improvement in the results when using the energy sourcing in a 'better' electricity mix (e.g. hydro power).

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) adds that the next step is to have a quick survey to understand what kind of energy mix members are interested to have in the tool.

No question or comment from SPICE members.

Reuse taskforce

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) shares the timeline and the advancements of the Reuse taskforce. He mentions that the phase 1 of the taskforce is still ongoing. Elsa Saouabi (Quantis) presents the integration roadmap of the reuse module to the SPICE Tool.

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) introduces the phase 2, which is currently identifying the parameters and scenarios allowing best environmental performance. An intermediary report will be shared in July to members to show the results of this study, giving members the opportunity to review it and to identify the case studies that will be showed in the external publication.

Nassim Bami (Quantis) introduces the process of reuse scenarios for case studies to identify parameters and scenarios allowing best environmental performance and presents a summary of the scenarios identified. This information was shared with members previously.

Q. Steve Owen (N°7 company) - It would be good to agree the case studies, maybe for the Refill at Home option we could use a 50ml day cream jar as they are popular and used by many brands?

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - For the moment the focus has been on two scenarios, a glass perfume and a shampoo.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) - Maybe when we publish it externally, we can consider this scenario, adding it in the scenarios assessed in the guidelines.

A. Steve Owen (N°7 company) – Yes, I think this a universal scenario we could use.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) - For the moment we had to make choices because it already represents a high number of tests to carry, and this is something that can be added at the external publication time, but for the moment. We are taking it in note thanks.

Q. Helene Villecroze (Chanel) - Do these scenarios also consider different types of refill packaging?

A. Nassim Bami (Quantis) - Yes, for perfume we are testing glass and aluminum refill packs. For the shampoo scenario, we are only testing doypack, as another type of packaging did not seem realistic and practical.

Q. David Petit (Hermes) - Do you think the number of reuses is realistic?

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) – For now, in the scenarios, we are simulating the different numbers of reuses which were defined with taskforce members.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) - It will allow you to calculate the point where your packaging allow impact reduction.

Q. David Petit (Hermes) - For these studies, if we compare to single use, do we consider 'worse' impact of the mother packaging than classic single use packaging?

A. Gabrielle Perier (Quantis) - It was not plan but we can include this scenario.

Q. David Petit (Hermes) - It would definitively interesting as it is always a question we have internally. The result is really dependent of the number of reuses.

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) - We could ask on our side as brand owners directly suppliers to provide those data.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

Glass Recyclability taskforce

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) introduces the plan for Glass and Plastics Recyclability workstreams for Year 6. Then, Jean Marc introduces how SPICE intends this year to join the CETIE working group this year to report to SPICE members on CETIE progress and give them feedback on how we could leverage learnings within our work. He details the aims of CETIE on recyclability. He then asks members for their feedback before proceeding to vote.

Q. Fabrice Rivet (FEVE) – Is it possible to have clarification on the representation on SPICE members, what about FEVE among CETIE and SPICE at the same time?

Q. Frédéric Dreux (Unilever) – I agree with Fabrice, it would be great to update the wording with the objective and how we will make the bridge between CETIE and SPICE via Quantis acting as SPICE project manager, rather than representing SPICE members.

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) – Thank you both, we have collected issues related to cosmetics glass packaging from SPICE members over the past years and we shared them with CETIE. The intention is to now take part in the dedicated CETIE working group, bearing in mind that some SPICE members are also members of CETIE and can directly interact. We also witnessed that a same company, representatives in CETIE and SPICE may be different persons, so the goal is to bridge those discussion as well, then share CETIE insights back to all SPICE members. When participating to CETIE working group we can share SPICE members common challenges on the glass cosmetics packaging recyclability.

A. Caroline Noyrez (MWE)- To clarify, the idea is for Quantis to be attending the CETIE working group as project manager of the SPICE initiative, not any member’s agent (nor the initiative itself, which has no legal personality), to follow the working group advancements, share with the SPICE initiative these advancements and share with the CETIE group SPICE initiative’s feedback and comments. Each member has discretion to join CETIE as well if it wishes. In any event, access to CETIE documents requires each member’s registration on CETIE’s database, SPICE will only provide feedback from the specific working group on glass recyclability. The aim of the vote is to validate the budget allocated to this participation and because Quantis will sign the CGUs / Charter of CETIE to participate (as per CETIE policy).

Q. Helene Villecroze (Chanel) – Just to confirm, the idea is for the SPICE initiative to join the CETIE group on only glass recyclability?

A. Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) – Yes.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

VOTE: DO YOU AGREE THAT SPICE BECOMES A MEMBER OF CETIE TO PARTICIPATE TO ‘DESIGN FOR RECYCLABILITY – GLASS PACKAGING’ WORKING GROUP?

Y/N

Company	Vote
Albea	Yes

Aptar	-
Axilone	-
Berry Global	Yes
Chanel	Yes
Clarins	Yes
Coty	Yes
Estee Lauder	Yes
Hermes Parfums	Yes
JPMS	Yes
L'Oréal	Yes
LVMH	Yes
Mary Kay	Yes
Meiyume	No
Natura & Co	Yes
N°7 Beauty Company	Yes
Puig	Yes
Shiseido	Yes
Sisley	-
Texen	No
Toly	Yes
Unilever Prestige	Yes

Voting result:

19 voting members

YES 89% - NO 11% of voting corporate members

SPICE become a member of CETIE to participate to the TF.

Plastic Recyclability taskforce

Elsa Saouabi (Quantis) reminds members on the work done within the recyclability taskforce for plastics and shares updates from RecyClass. For this summer the new tests will be updated on SPICE appendix. Elsa also gives members an update on the testing plans. Elsa then asks some help to be able to make progress on plastic recyclability topic and asks members to contact her to provide some support on rigid rolling packaging, small size and label removability.

Q. Helene Villecroze (Chanel) - Are you interested by the material for flexible packaging recyclability?

A. Elsa Saouabi (Quantis) - Yes, we are interested by the format, size and materials.

A. Steve Owen (n°7 company) - I can help with the small sizes as we have done lots of recyclability work at the Recycling facilities with small packs such as 30 ml skincare tubes.

No additional question or comment from SPICE members.

4. Timeline and next steps

Jean-Marc Fontaine (Quantis) finally presents the planning and next steps towards SPICE Year 6. He thanks all members for their votes and active participation during this committee. He reminds of the next steps and suggest holding September 19th, 2-6pm CET for the members' committee #2, Year 6.

No additional questions or comments from SPICE Members.

Closing of the meeting